

Public Document Pack

Argyll and Bute Council
Comhairle Earra Ghaidheal agus Bhoid

Customer Services
Executive Director: Douglas Hendry



22 Hill Street, Dunoon, Argyll, PA23 7AP
Tel: 01369 707130 Fax: 01369 705948

27 May 2010

BUTE AND COWAL AREA COMMITTEE - TUESDAY, 1 JUNE 2010 **QUEENS HALL, DUNOON - 10:00 AM**

I enclose herewith an item on the Agenda for the above meeting.

Douglas Hendry
Executive Director - Customer Services

SUPPLEMENTARY PACK

6. DEVELOPMENT AND INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES

(b) Footpath at Kilbride Road (Pages 1 - 8)

BUTE & COWAL AREA COMMITTEE

Councillor Robert Macintyre
Councillor Alister McAlister
Councillor James McQueen
Councillor Ron Simon
Councillor Dick Walsh

Councillor Bruce Marshall (Chair)
Councillor Alex McNaughton
Councillor Len Scoullar (Vice-Chair)
Councillor Isobel Strong

Contact: Shirley MacLeod, Area Corporate Services Manager

This page is intentionally left blank

ARGYLL & BUTE COUNCIL**BUTE & COWAL
AREA COMMITTEE****ROADS & AMENITY SERVICES****1 JUNE 2010**

KILBRIDE ROAD – RISK ASSESSMENT & BUSINESS CASE

1.0 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 This paper is to brief the Bute & Cowal Area Committee on the actions taken by the Roads Operations Unit regarding concerns expressed by Members with the regard to road safety at Kilbride Bridge – Kilbride road, Dunoon.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 The Bute & Cowal Area Committee notes:

2.1.1 That a full written risk assessment has now been completed.

2.1.2 That options to address the risk of pedestrian/vehicle conflict with a permanent solution will be developed and appraised and a preferred option subject to Outline Business Case development. The Outline Business Case will be taken forward and appraised as part of the Department's Asset Sustainability Capital Planning programme for 2011/12.

3.0 DETAIL

- 3.1 Following discussion with the Area Committee Chairman and Members in April 2010, a Full Written risk Assessment has now been completed by the Roads Operations Unit, which is attached at Appendix 1.
- 3.2 The Risk Assessment highlights that due to a history of minor landslips a wooden post and wire fence had to be erected within the former footway surfaced area in June 2008 to address the risk to pedestrians associated with the steep embankment and footway surface. This action necessitated that the road became a *shared surface* for pedestrians and vehicular traffic, and appropriate signage was erected.
- 3.3 The Risk Assessment at Appendix 1 confirms that that although the risk of pedestrians/vehicle conflict has been reduced and is considered to be low, a number of potential options are proposed to address the risk to pedestrians with a permanent solution.
- 3.4 In line with the Council's Asset Management and Capital Planning Guidance, an Outline Business Case (OBC) will be developed by the Network Manager, Neil Brown. The OBC will develop and appraise

options to provide a permanent solution to address the risk of pedestrian/vehicle conflict and pedestrian safety and will identify and appraise the “preferred option” in terms of ***impact, affordability, deliverability*** and ***risk***. The development of the OBC will meet the Council’s Asset Management and Capital Planning timetable for 2011/12.

4.0 APPENDIX

APPENDIX 1 Risk Assessment Kilbride Road, Dunoon

AJL Mactaggart
Executive Director
Development & Infrastructure Services

1 June 2010

ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL

INITIAL RISK ASSESSMENT FORM

1. Date of Assessment 17 May 2010

Ref No K Rd/May 2010

Section Roads Services

Department Development &
InfrastructureTask **No footway Auchamore Rd-Kilbride Bridge-Kilbride Rd. Property known as Longacre, Mr and Mrs K Kennday**

Frequency of Task	Annually	Monthly	Weekly	Daily	When Required	X
-------------------	----------	---------	--------	-------	---------------	---

Groups/Individuals Pedestrians No. of people directly involved Not known but >1

2. Potential/Hazards (Please tick) C = Controlled U = Uncontrolled N/A = Not Applicable

	C	U	N/A		C	U	N/A		C	U	N/A
1. Machinery/Plant			X	8. Handling/Lifting			X	15. Working at Height			X
2. Slip/Trip			X	9. Vehicle			X	16. Dangerous Substances			X
3. Ventilation			X	10. Fire/Explosion			X	17. Electricity			X
4. Noise/Vibration			X	11. Hygiene			X	18. Work Equipment /Tools			X
5. Lighting			X	12. Pressurised System			X	19. Temperature			X
6. Moving/Falling Objects			X	13. Visual Display Equipment			X	20. Weather/Environment		X	
7. Work Below Ground			X	14. Violence			X	21. Other (Please List)		X	

Other Hazards 21 Pedestrian/vehicle conflict due to lack of footway

Could an incident arising out of this task affect people not directly involved? Yes
Maximum Number >1

3. List the means of control e.g. Statutory, Departmental, Control etc.

No.	Control Method	Ref.

ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL

INITIAL RISK ASSESSMENT FORM

4. List the items, which have no means of control or are not adequately controlled.

No.	Concerns	Ref*
20		f,11
21		D,2,3,4,5,7

* Reference: Select the alpha/numerical phrases, which best describes the probability of an accident occurring and the probable level of severity.

a) High Probability	c) Probable	e) Possible but unusual
b) Likely, only to be expected	d) Could Happen	f) Unlikely
1. Fatality	5. Arm/Leg Injury	9. Burn/Scald
2. Head Injury	6. Eye Injury	10. Electric Shock
3. Back Injury	7. Hand/Foot Injury	11. Illness
4. Chest Injury	8. Ear Injury	

5. List recommendations / comments, which you feel, may be helpful in resolving these concerns.

No.	Recommendations/Comments
20	Suitable clothing required, outwith Dept control. Low Risk
21	Appropriate signing to alert vehicle drivers and pedestrians to the shared road space. Medium Risk.

Name

Designation

This assessment must be completed, signed and a copy returned to: Logie Collins, Health and Safety Manager

Final Assessors Action	Safety Section Use Only	Final Assessors Remarks:-
Immediate Action		Original signed copies held at Head Office, Manse Brae, Lochgilphead.
Follow Up Action		
No Further Action		

Note: Where additional space is required to record any part of the assessment please attached a separate sheet identified with the Risk Assessment Form No.

PER/S/200

ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL

INITIAL RISK ASSESSMENT

	A	B	C	D	E	F
1	H	H	H	H	M	L
2	H	H	H	M	M	L
3	H	H	H	M	M	L
4	H	H	H	M	M	L
5	H	H	H	M	L	L
6	H	H	H	M	L	L
7	H	H	H	M	L	L
8	H	H	H	M	L	L
9	H	H	H	M	L	L
10	H	H	H	M	L	L
11	H	H	H	M	L	L

H = HIGH RISK
M = MEDIUM RISK
L = LOW RISK

TO BE USED IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE INITIAL RISK ASSESSMENT FORM

This page is intentionally left blank

Risk Assessment Kilbride Road, Dunoon

No Footway. Auchamore Rd-Kilbride Bridge-Kilbride Rd. Property known as Longacre belonging to Mr and Mrs K Kennedy

Preamble

The Kilbride Road Landslip contract was nearing completion in January 2008. Boundary fences were being erected as part of that contract. Mr Kennedy approached site staff to bring the condition of the boundary fence at the back of the existing footway in Kilbride Road to their attention.

Site Survey

A visual survey confirmed Mr Kennedy's assertion that the boundary fence was beyond economic repair and furthermore a new fence could not be erected on the same line as the remains of the existing fence. Erosion and numerous minor landslips of the embankment had contributed over time to a lack of ground support for any new fencing materials.

The existing footway had also been reduced in width, in some places to as little as 0.5m with a maximum usable width of 1.3m over short lengths (30% of the total kerbed length). There was no support at the rear of the footway.

Conclusion

Inadequate support at the rear of the footway meant that a new fence could not be erected and the footway could not be reinstated. There was no protection to prevent a pedestrian falling down a steep embankment or tripping due to the failure of the footway edge. Therefore the condition of the existing footway was such that its continued use posed a potential safety hazard.

A wooden post and wire fence was erected within the footway surfaced area during May/June 2008. The horizontal line of the fence did allow refuges at the pedestrian and vehicular gates to Longacre. The road, therefore, would be a shared surface for pedestrians and vehicular traffic

The risk of the pedestrian/vehicle conflict was reduced by the provision of appropriate signing (sign diagram numbers 544.1 and 547.3) in Auchamore Road and Kilbride Road, alerting drivers and pedestrians that there was no footway for 197 yards. Note that part of this length (50 yards) has never had a footway (the western end of Auchamore Road and Kilbride Bridge). The speed limit is 30 mph although the 85%ile is likely to be approximately 20 mph. The Annual Average Daily Flow (AADF) for Kilbride Road is estimated at 250, considerably less than the examples shown in the list below.

The speed and AADF for Kilbride Road indicate a significant lower risk to pedestrians than that posed in similar situations.

There are several examples within Cowal, and throughout Argyll and Bute, which are similar in nature. These are listed below with any existing mitigating measures and relevant AADF figures. The list is not exhaustive.

Road	Location	Signing	Comment
U46	Kilbride Road	Adult/Child triangle+197 yards	within 30mph limits AADF <250
U3	Alexander Street (example for AADF figure only)		within 30mph limits AADF 495
A815	Sandy Beach	Children At Play (Southbound only)	within 30mph limits
A815	Hafton Holiday Village-Ferrymans housing scheme	Adult/Child triangle	within 40mph limits AADF 2756
A8003	Bobbies Brae-Royal Brae Tighnabraich		within 30mph limits
B836	Clachaig	Adult/Child triangle. East and westbound	National speed limit AADF 834
A815	The Coylet Inn	Adult/Child triangle+200 yards. North and southbound	National speed limit
A880	Red Bridge-Police Station		within 40mph limits AADF 2021
B839	Lochgoilhead Police Station-War Memorial		within 30mph limits
C9	Ardentenny		within 30mph limits AADF 565
C7 &U28	Kames public toilets to Tank Landing Slip and Shore Road		within 30mph limits

AADF Annual Average Daily Flow

Proposals

No	Proposal	Comment
1	Rebuild and reinforce the embankment within property known as Longacre. Reinstate the existing footway and increase width to a minimum of 1.5m	Requires land take and considerable capital funding
2	Reduce road width within existing road to a single lane operation and introduce 'one way' traffic system. Build new footway	Requires a TRO. Implications for existing 'give and take' traffic system in Kilbride Road and for existing private and commercial accesses onto Kilbride Road. Requires considerable capital funding. Requires an assessment of the suitability of nearby junctions at Auchamore Road/Alexander Street, Auchamore Road/Edward Street and Auchamore Road/Victoria Road
3	Reduce road width within existing road to a single lane operation and introduce traffic lights. Build new footway	Requires a TRO. Implications for existing 'give and take' traffic system in Kilbride Road and for existing private and commercial accesses onto Kilbride Road. Requires considerable capital funding. Requires an assessment of the suitability of nearby junctions at Auchamore Road/Alexander Street, Auchamore Road/Edward Street and Auchamore Road/Victoria Road